

CLEARY GOTTlieb STEEN & HAMILTON LLP

ONE LIBERTY PLAZA  
NEW YORK, NY 10006-1470  
(212) 225-2000  
FACSIMILE (212) 225-3999  
WWW.CLEARYGOTTLIEB.COM

WASHINGTON, DC • PARIS • BRUSSELS • LONDON • MOSCOW  
FRANKFURT • COLOGNE • ROME • MILAN • HONG KONG  
BEIJING • BUENOS AIRES • SÃO PAULO • ABU DHABI • SEOUL

Writer's Direct Dial: +1 (212) 225-2550  
E-Mail: lliman@cgsh.com

LAURENT ALPERT  
VICTOR I. LEWKOW  
LESLIE N. SILVERMAN  
ROBERT L. TORTORIELLO  
LEE C. BUCHHEIT  
JAMES M. PEASLEE  
ALAN L. BELLER  
THOMAS J. MOLONEY  
JONATHAN I. BLACKMAN  
MICHAEL L. RYAN  
ROBERT P. DAVIS  
YARON Z. REICH  
RICHARD S. LINGER  
STEVEN G. HOROWITZ  
JAMES A. DUNCAN  
STEVEN M. LOEB  
CRAIG B. BROD  
MITCHELL A. LOWENTHAL  
EDWARD J. ROSEN  
LAWRENCE B. FRIEDMAN  
NICOLAS GRABAR  
CHRISTOPHER E. AUSTIN  
SETH GROSSHANDLER  
WILLIAM A. GROLL  
HOWARD S. ZELBO  
DAVID E. BRODSKY  
MICHAEL R. LAZERWITZ  
ARTHUR H. KOHN  
RICHARD J. COOPER  
JEFFREY S. LEWIS  
PAUL J. SHIM  
STEVEN L. WILNER  
ERIKA W. NIJENHUIS  
LINDSEY P. GRANFIELD  
ANDRES DE LA CRUZ  
DAVID C. LOPEZ  
CARMEN A. CORRALES  
JAMES L. BROMLEY

MICHAEL A. GERSTENZANG  
LEWIS J. LIMAN  
LEV L. DASSIN  
NEIL Q. WHORISKEY  
JORGE U. JUANITORENA  
MICHAEL D. WEINBERGER  
DAVID LEINWAND  
JEFFREY A. ROSENTHAL  
ETHAN A. KLINGSBERG  
MICHAEL J. VOLKOVITSCH  
MICHAEL D. DAYAN  
CARMINE D. BOCCUZZI, JR.  
JEFFREY D. KARPFF  
KIMBERLY BROWN BLACKLOW  
ROBERT J. RAYMOND  
LEONARD C. JACOBY  
SANDRA L. FLOW  
FRANCISCO L. CESTERO  
FRANCESCA L. ODELL  
WILLIAM L. MCRAE  
JASON FACTOR  
MARGARET S. PEONIS  
LISA M. SCHWEITZER  
JUAN G. GIRÁLDEZ  
DUANE MCLAUGHLIN  
BREON S. PEACE  
MEREDITH E. KOTLER  
CHANTAL E. KORDULA  
BENET J. O'REILLY  
DAVID AMAN  
ADAM E. FLEISHER  
SEAN A. ONEAL  
GLENN P. MCGRORY  
MATTHEW P. SALERNO  
MICHAEL J. ALBANO  
VICTOR L. HOU  
ROGER A. COOPER  
AMY R. SHAPIRO

JENNIFER KENNEDY PARK  
ELIZABETH LENAS  
LUKE A. BAREFOOT  
PAMELA L. MARCOGLIESE  
PAUL M. TIGER  
JONATHAN S. KOLODNER  
RESIDENT PARTNERS

SANDRA M. ROCKS  
S. DOUGLAS BORISKY  
JUDITH KASSEL  
DAVID E. WEBB  
PENELOPE L. CHRISTOPHOU  
BOAZ S. MORAG  
MARY E. ALCOCK  
DAVID H. HERRINGTON  
HEIDE H. ILGENFRITZ  
HUGH C. CONROY, JR.  
KATHLEEN M. EMBERGER  
WALLACE L. LARSON, JR.  
JAMES D. SMALL  
AVRAM E. LUFT  
DANIEL ILAN  
ANDREW WEAVER  
HELENA K. GRANNIS  
GRANT M. BINDER  
MEYER H. FEDIDA  
JOHN V. HARRISON  
CAROLINE F. HAYDAY  
RESIDENT COUNSEL

LOUISE M. PARENT  
OF COUNSEL

March 11, 2015

VIA ECF

Hon. Andrew J. Peck, U.S.M.J.  
Southern District of New York  
Daniel Patrick Moynihan Courthouse  
500 Pearl Street, Courtroom 20D  
New York, New York 10007

Re: *Rio Tinto plc v. Vale S.A., et al.*, Civil Action No. 14-cv-3042 (RMB) (AJP) (S.D.N.Y.)

Dear Judge Peck:

Defendant Vale S.A. ("Vale") respectfully submits this letter to request leave from the Court to file several Applications for International Letters of Request seeking discovery pursuant to the Hague Convention on the Taking of Evidence Abroad (the "Hague Convention") under seal pursuant to this Court's protective order (Dkt. No. 81).

Vale is seeking international discovery from the foreign investigative firms Plaintiff Rio Tinto has identified as having assisted it in its purported "lengthy investigation . . . into the activities of Vale and BSGR at Simandou" (Am. Compl. ¶ 146) that serves as part of the basis of its allegation of equitable tolling of the statute of limitations of its RICO claim. Rio Tinto has produced reports from the foreign firms it retained to conduct competitive intelligence, located in the United Kingdom, France and South Africa (without producing any reports from a U.S. firm). Rio Tinto has designated the reports it produced from these investigative firms as "Highly Confidential – Attorneys' Eyes Only."

Vale requested the Court's guidance on how to submit an Application for Letters of Request that referenced these so-designated materials at the last conference. Following the Court's order (Feb. 27, 2015 Hr'g Tr. 38:7-39:4), on March 4, 2014, Vale sent Rio Tinto a draft rider of its proposed Requests to be included in its Application. Vale proposed to withdraw at this time its request to remove the "Highly Confidential – Attorneys' Eyes Only" designation from the investigative reports, as long as Rio Tinto would not object to the filing of the

Hon. Andrew J. Peck, p. 2

Application with these references unsealed on the basis that such filing would be in breach of the Protective Order.

Defendant Vale requested that Rio Tinto provide it with its position on these Requests by March 6, 2015. On that day, Rio Tinto advised that it had not yet reviewed the Requests in detail and requested additional time to do so. Concerned about possible delays the process for such Applications might take, Vale informed Rio Tinto and this Court that it intended to submit its Application under seal by Wednesday, March 11, 2015, unless the parties reached an agreement on this issue (*see* Dkt. No. 208 at 3).

On March 11, 2015, Vale and Rio Tinto conferred regarding Vale's proposed Requests. Rio Tinto indicated that it objects to the de-designation of references to the investigative reports and Vale's Applications being filed unsealed.

In that connection, Vale notes the following:

1. References to the specific statements in the Requests on which evidence is being sought from the investigative firms in question is potentially critical to satisfying the specificity requirements the foreign courts impose on Letters of Request, and therefore to the enforceability of the requests.

2. There is in fact nothing confidential about the short references to these specific statements in the reports that are included in the proposed Letters of Request. Similar assertions have already been made publicly both in the parties' pleadings and briefs in this action, and in the news media.

3. The Letters of Request would, to the best of our knowledge, not be public documents in the courts where their execution will be sought. The only persons with sight of them will be the parties to this action, Your Honor, the executing foreign courts, and the investigative firm in question itself, which is already aware of the contents of its own report.

For the foregoing reasons, there should be no obstacle in publicly filing these Applications. However, to avoid delay and needless motion practice on this issue, Vale requests leave to file the Applications under seal at this time. Rio Tinto does not oppose Vale filing these Applications under seal, but advised us that it might oppose the Applications themselves (*i.e.* the issuance of the Letters of Request to the investigation firms).

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Lewis J. Liman  
Lewis J. Liman

Cc: All counsel of record